

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, February 25, 2008 Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: MARK WIENKE, Chair

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Vice-Chair

CLAY AURELL JIM BLAKELEY GARY MOSEL RANDY MUDGE DAWN SHERRY PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION BRUCE BARTLETT

LIAISON:

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST		
		(See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing) Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. Plans - floor, roof, etc. Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: Plans - floor, roof, etc. Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

NOTICE:

- 1. That on February 21, 2008 at 3:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- 2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Call to order.

The meeting was called to order at 3:10 p.m. by Vice-Chair Manson-Hing.

B. Roll call.

Members present: Aurell, Blakeley, Mosel, Mudge, Sherry, Zink, Manson-Hing

Members absent: Wienke

Staff present: Bedard, Limon, Shafer

(Blakeley & Mosel arrived at 3:13 p.m. Limon left at 3:35 p.m. Mudge arrived at 4:16, left at 5:54 p.m.)

C. Public Comment:

James Kahan, opposed to review of mobile communications facility on Consent Calendar.

D. Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of February 11, 2008.

Motion: Approve the minutes of February 11, 2008.

Action: Zink/Sherry, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge and Wienke absent.)

Public comment: James Kahan: requested a change to his comments concerning Item #1, 3230 State Street.

E. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Approve the Consent Calendar of February 19, 2008 and February 25, 2008.

Action: Sherry/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge and Wienke absent.)

- F. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
 - 1) Ms. Bedard announced that Item #6, 1236 San Andres, is pulled from the agenda due to an appeal of Planning Commission decision.

- 2) Mr. Limon reported that an additional special meeting is requested to discuss how to comply with Council direction regarding the landscaping project at 601 E. Anapamu. Members Aurell, Mosel and Mudge will attend the meeting at noon on Monday, March 3.
- 3) Mr. Limon requested have an additional meeting due to the backlog of applications. A date will be determined.

G. Subcommittee Reports.

Member Manson-Hing reported he read a newspaper article which stated that the Airport design work was completed three months ahead of schedule. Mr. Limon responded that he anticipates the airport design return for further review.

H. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Member Zink reported a possible building entrance violation at the Sears store. A parking lot entrance has been closed and is no longer pedestrian friendly. (Photos were submitted.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 2032 OAK AVE

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-091-007 Application Number: MST2008-00013

Owner: Rangel Kelly
Architect: James Zimmerman

(Proposal for a new one-bedroom residential unit [unit #4] on a site with three existing residential units. The new 745 square foot one-bedroom unit addition would be above a garage. The project also proposes to relocate an existing uncovered parking space, a new 200 square foot carport, a new detached 200 square foot trellis, and convert 70 square feet of the existing garage to storage space. The parcel is currently developed with two two-bedroom units [957 square feet and 1,025 square feet] and one three-bedroom unit [1,284 square feet] with a total of 6 parking spaces [three covered and three uncovered]. The total existing and proposed development would result in four residential units and seven parking spaces. The project requires review by the Staff Hearing officer for requested modifications.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND REVIEW BY STAFF HEARING OFFICER.)

(Time: 3:33)

Present: James Zimmerman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m. A letter from Paula Westbury, opposed, was read. Bob Haines, opposed to the parking. Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1) The Board can not support the garage modification. The proposed modifications for garage and parking are not aesthetically beneficial under the current proposal.

- 2) The applicant is encouraged to revise the site plan layout to eliminate the need for Modifications.
- 3) Redesign the architecture for less appendages and cantilevers.
- 4) Most Board members can support the third story element in the size presented.
- 5) On the elevations, show adjacent buildings at the northeast.
- 6) Provide quarter inch scale drawings of all floors and elevations of proposed area of work.
- 7) Provide composite elevations of the site showing all structures on site.

Action: Zink/ Blakeley, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge and Wienke absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 1235 VERONICA SPRINGS RD

COUNTY Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-039 Application Number: MST2003-00793

Owner: Hillside House

Architect: Detlev Peikert Group

Applicant: John Polansky
Applicant: Carl Steinberg
Agent: Teri Zuniga

(Proposal to annex the 23 acre property into the City's jurisdiction, demolish the existing 28,700 square foot Hillside House facility and all accessory buildings, except for one building known as the Harmony House, which is proposed to be relocated on site. The new development includes 125 new dwelling units, an administration office, community center, leasing and management office, non-profit lease space, and therapy pool. Of the proposed 125 new dwelling units, 12 units are proposed to be special need units, 28 are proposed rental units, 74 are proposed market rate units, and 11 are proposed affordable units. The development includes 5.5 acres of structures, roads and parking [includes 183 covered and 79 uncovered for a total of 262 parking spaces]. The remaining area will be 4.75 acres of common open space and 13 acres of passive open space and creek setbacks. The proposal includes restoration of riparian areas along Arroyo Burro Creek and will include the removal of 176 trees [not including oaks or palms], to be replaced with 209 riparian associated trees. Total proposed grading includes 7,200 cubic feet of cut and 15,900 cubic yards of fill. The project requires City Council approval for annexation, General Plan Amendment, and Zone changes, and Planning Commission approval of a Tentative Subdivision Map and Development Plan.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, PLANNING COMMISSION REVIEW, AND CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL FOR ANNEXATION.)

(Time: 6:54)

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect, Lisa Plowman, Katie O'Riley-Rodgers, Gordon Brewer, Peikert Group Architects; Pam Flynt, Executive Director Hillside House; Peter Lawson, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Staff Comment: Peter Lawson, Project Planner, stated that at this time the project is deemed incomplete, and Environmental Determination has not been completed.

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m.

- 1) Laurie Moon, opposed: spoke about incompatibility with the rural setting; lack of parking.
- 2) Shannon O'Bryan: addressed density; safety access; gas line; traffic; incompatibility.
- 3) Naomi Kovacks, Citizen's Planning Association: spoke about additional studies needed; height

limits; land use.

- 4) Sandra Jacobs: addressed inadequate parking; regional impact issues, archleological resources, historic structures.
- 5) Judy Orias, Allied Neighborhood Association: project and density incompatible with neighborhood; removal of trees; geological and fire hazards; additional studies needed; security needed; transportation impacts.
- 6) Nicki Flax, Santa Barbara County Housing Board of Commissioners: Hillside House presided development of neighborhood; social justice.
- 7) Three letters from Patricia Foley, Braemar Ranch Homeowners Association, and Judy Orias, President Allied Neighborhoods Association, were read into the record. Public comment closed at 4:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board found that the project styling and amount of detail are positive; however the Board would like the following addressed:
- 2) Provide responses to the EIR.
- 3) Show adjacent buildings on the site plan.
- 4) Provide and show allocated MTD bus stop locations and routes.
- 5) Provide and show visitor and staff parking.
- 6) Provide comprehensive elevations showing streetscapes.
- 7) Provide site sections showing valleys between buildings.
- 8) Provide sensitivity to Veronica Springs Road in terms of scale, massing, and the amount of green space between structures. Provide a higher proportion of greenscape to hardscape.
- 9) Examine greater opportunities to preserve significant trees. Landscape architect to provide details.
- 10) Enhance the presence of the Hillside House and its entry to make a significant statement.
- 11) Reduce the amount of continuously visible garage door elevations, study mitigation methods. Consider landscaping to soften.
- 12) Study site accessibility for residents of Hillside House.
- 13) Study the massing of Unit D, particularly at ends and the rear garage elevation.
- 14) Study density and building mass at the perimeter of the proposed development, especially at the access road, and along Veronica Springs Road. Structures should be lower in scale and compatible to the creek and residential neighborhoods.

Action: Aurell/Mudge, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Wienke absent.)

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:54 UNTIL 6:20 P.M.***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 1418 GILLESPIE ST R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-031-026 Application Number: MST2007-00487

Owner: Robert and Rebecca Betancourt

Architect: Garcia Architects

(Proposal to convert an existing 3,640 square foot four-unit apartment complex to a four-unit condominium complex. The proposal also includes new storage units, reconfiguration of existing carports, a new refuse enclosure, and other site improvements. The existing residential configuration is composed of four two-bedroom units each at approximately 1,178 square feet. The proposal includes eight parking spaces: six covered and two uncovered. The project requires review by the Staff Hearing officer for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND REVIEW BY THE STAFF HEARING OFFICER FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP.)

(Time: 6:20)

Present: Gill Garcia, Architect; Robert Betancourt, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:31 p.m. as no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Applicant to comply with all items listed in the Condo Conversion packet (SBMC 28.88).
- 2) Provide a preliminary landscape plan. In particular, look for ways to provide canopy trees and additional landscaping elements to soften the architecture.
- 3) Remodel the unit entries, front entry doors, and entry decks, including the quality and aesthetics.
- 4) Study the elements of the east and west elevations, including infill of the second floor
- 5) Coordinate upper deck landings with the lower decks for compatibility of design.

Action: Aurell/Blakeley, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Mudge absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

4. 1108 OLIVE ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-012
Application Number: MST2007-00352
Owner: Andre R. Schneider
Architect: Bryan Pollard

(Proposal to convert an existing one-story 1,138 square foot single family residence to a condominium unit and construct a new, attached, two-story 1,529 square foot condominium unit on a 7,349 square foot lot in the R-3 zone. The conversion of the existing unit includes a new 874 square foot second-story addition, including a 65 square foot second-story balcony, and an attached 520 square foot two-car garage. The new 1,459 square foot unit will also include an attached 401 square foot two-car garage. The final project will result in a 4,396 square foot, two unit condominium structure, including garages.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER REVIEW OF A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP.)

(Time: 6:48)

Present: Bryan Pollard, Architect; Andre Schneider, Owner.

Public Comment opened at 6:57 p.m.

Letters from Nancy Cohen, Mark Wienke and Darlene and Jack Zehren, Paula Westbury, and Scott Wenz were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 6:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely Staff Hearing Officer with return to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The reduction in height at unit B is appreciated.
- 2) The Board finds the size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the project.
- 3) Study the front elevation for more articulation, specifically to offset the flat look of the second-story wall face.
- 4) Provide a complete landscape plan and additional information regarding proposed trees, tree heights and sizes along the north property line.
- 5) Provide grading and drainage plans showing how run off is mitigated.

Action: Paul Zink/Gary Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mudge and Wienke absent.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 226 W DE LA GUERRA ST

R-3/R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-015 Application Number: MST2004-00675

Owner: Steve Harrel

(Proposal for a two-story, 3,231 square foot triplex residential condominium. The proposal would add 138 square feet to an existing 978 square foot single family residence, construct a second-story with two attached residential units. Parking is provided in a new attached 236 square foot one-car garage and existing four-car garage on the 6,250 square foot lot. Project received Staff Hearing officer Approval on 12/19/2007 [Resolution No. 107-07].)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 107-07.)

(Time: 7:20)

Present: Steve Harrel, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 7:26 p.m. A letter from Paula Westbury was read. Public comment closed at 7:26 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval, return on Consent Calendar with the following comment:

Applicant to provide a color board and landscape plan.

Action: Paul Zink/Dawn Sherry, 3/0/2. Motion carried. (Mudge and Wienke absent. Mosel

stepped down.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

6. 1236 SAN ANDRES ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-151-001 Application Number: MST2006-00364 Owner: Ruth E Mudry Trust

Architect: Kirk Gradin

Owner: Casas Del Parque, LLC Applicant: Blankenshp Construction

(Proposal to construct four, two-story residential condominium units. Three of the units would be approximately 1,000 square feet and one unit would be approximately 1,100 square feet. Each unit would have an attached two-car garage for a total of eight parking spaces on the 10,048 square foot parcel. The proposal includes demolition of all existing structures and 140 cubic yards of grading outside the building footprints. The project received Planning Commission approval [Resolution No. 01-08] on 1/10/2008.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 01-08.)

Postponed indefinitely due to Planning Commission appeal.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

7. 302 S VOLUNTARIO ST

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-281-010 Application Number: MST2007-00551

Owner: Mark Williams Architect: William Cooper

(Proposal to demolish an existing 882 square foot single-family residence and 171 square foot garage and construct a two-story, three-unit apartment building consisting of a 1,287 square foot two-bedroom unit, two 847 square foot one-bedroom units, and three attached one-car garages totaling 667 square feet. The proposed development will consist of 2,981 residential square footage on a 6,250 square foot parcel.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(Time: 7:33)

Present: William Cooper, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:48 p.m. A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged. Public comment closed at 7:49 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval, with return on Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1) Applicant to study the increasing the depth of the entry opening.

- 2) At entry projection lower the plaster roof element at the entry opening to avoid contact with the second-story banding element.
- 3) The Board prefers a two-sided open balcony rather than side punch outs.
- 4) Consider a two colored exterior plaster scheme.
- 5) The building should be recessed approximately a minimum 2 to 3 inches in the wall.
- 6) The one-story roof is to be constructed entirely of two-piece clay tile. The Board understands there will a blend of one- and two-piece tile on the second-story roof.

Action: Sherry/ Mosel, 4/2/0. Motion carried. (Zink and Manson-Hing opposed. Mudge and

Wienke absent.)

I. Adjournment.

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 8:18 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

FINAL REVIEW

A. 1295 COAST VILLAGE RD

C-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-293-007
Application Number: MST2006-00744
Owner: Montecito Copus, LP
Architect: Ketzel and Goodman
Business Name: Montecito Inn

(Proposal to remove 18 square feet of the existing mechanical room, raise the parapet wall approximately 45", add an approximately 45" high wall and fireplace at the second story deck patio, revise roof structure at the patio area, add new 5' x 6.8' doors from the vestibule to the patio, remove one window adjacent to the east facing wall, change the deck material, add a new water feature at the parapet wall and add lighting and outlets at patio all on a 1.3 acre commercial lot. The proposal also includes replacing existing doors with three new windows at the third floor.)

(Request for new Preliminary Approval that expired on 1-8-2008. Final Approval is also requested.)

Preliminary Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM

B. 1221 CHINO ST R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-141-010 Application Number: MST2003-00858

Applicant: Pat Strum
Owner: Clint Lefler
Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal to convert an existing duplex into two condominium units by elevating, relocating and constructing a new unit underneath. The existing two-car garage will be demolished and replaced with a new unit. A total of four condominiums with seven covered and two uncovered parking spaces are proposed. Project received Planning Commission Approval (Resolution No. 047-04) of the Tentative Subdivision Map on 10/14/2004.)

(Review After Final to replace a window with a door at the garage, remove French doors at bedroom, remove cased opening below deck; relocate door and cover, and add a dormer to the south elevation.)

Public comment: letter from Paula Westbury.

Final Approval as submitted of the Review After Final.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD

C. 927 OLIVE ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-302-031 Application Number: MST2006-00421

Architect: Keith Rivera
Owner: Fiesta Olive, LLC
Applicant: Aaron Amuchastegui

(Proposal for a five-unit condominium development consisting of 2 three-story buildings. The project includes 5 three-story, one- and two-bedroom residential condominium units ranging from 1,800 to 2,100 square feet in size. Each unit has an attached two-car garage and there are three uncovered parking spaces and a central auto court. A Voluntary Lot Merger is proposed to combine two parcels for the 11,761 square foot site. The project includes demolition of the two existing single-family dwellings at 927 and 933 Olive Street and 800 cubic yards of grading. Project received Planning Commission Approval on 9/13/07.)

(Project received Preliminary Approval on 12/03/07.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 037-07.)

Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar.

CONTINUED ITEM (continued from 2/11/08)

D. 3869 STATE ST C-2/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-037 Application Number: MST2008-00034

Owner: Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barbara

Architect: Arcadia Studio

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" replacement of seven Tipuana trees with seven 15 gallon Agonis Flexuosa [Willow Myrtle] trees at the Grace Lutheran Church of Santa Barbara. Proposal to abate enforcement case ENF 2006-00812.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH ABR LANDSCAPE DESIGN GUIDELINES.)

Public comment: Kathiann Brown: would have liked discussion of alternate trees (other than "as-built" willow myrtle).

Final Approval as noted on sheet 1:1: 1) the four proposed Quercus Virginiana (Southern Live Oak) canopy trees are each to be 15 gallons; 2) the proposed Tristaniopsis Laurina canopy tree is to be 15 gallons.

CONTINUED ITEM (cont from 2/11/08)

E. 407 BATH ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-192-011 Application Number: MST2008-00045

Owner: Leonard Himelsein, Revocable Trust

(Proposal to permit "as-built" removal of existing canary island pines and replace with 6 twenty-four inch box weeping bottlebrush trees and 30 five-gallon Japanese Privets along northwest property line. Application is submitted to abate enforcement case ENF2007-00080.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH ABR LANDSCAPE DESIGN GUIDELINES.)

Public comment: Kathiann Brown: canopy/variety would be appreciated, with regular maintenance.

Final Approval as noted on sheet L-1: 1) existing Canary Island pine to be removed; 2) replace the three proposed 24 inch box Eucalyptus Sideroxylon with three Pinus Canariensis, 3) optional removal of three existing Yellow Bollards.

FINAL REVIEW

F. 18 BATH ST R-4/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-092-014
Application Number: MST2007-00572
Owner: Kazali Trust
Landscape Architect: Robert Adams

(Proposal to upgrade and relocate the existing Spa and construct a new 10 foot timber arbor over the spa; replace the existing as-built 37 square foot spa equipment/storage shed with a new 37.5 square foot spa equipment/storage shed in the same location; proposal to demolish the existing fencing gate and steps with new stucco wall and safety fencing and gate around the courtyard; proposal to replace existing raised paving and decking with at-grade enhanced concrete paving and curbing to match existing; and removal of three multi-stem tree/shrubs and add approximately 120 square feet of new landscaping. This project is located in the Coastal SD-3 Zone and requires review of a Coastal Exemption.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH ABR LANDSCAPE DESIGN GUIDELINES.)

Final Approval as noted (sheet L-6). 1) Spa enclosure fascia detail to extend stucco wall up to roof tiles and confirm roof tile extends over stucco wall. 2) Confirm double starter on spa/equipment enclosure.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Dawn Sherry, with the exception of landscaping for Item D, E and F, reviewed by Randy Mudge. Consent Calendar ended at 2:30 p.m.